April 15, 2003

Ms. Mary Lookadoo
Superintendent
Mineola Independent School District
1000 West Loop 564
Mineola, Texas 75773

OR2003-2551

Dear Ms. Lookadoo:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 179463.

The Mineola Independent School District (the "district") received a request for four categories of information related to the evaluation of the district superintendent. You state that some responsive information has been released to the requestor. You claim that a portion of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We will first address your responsibilities under the Public Information Act. Pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. However, you submitted a copy of the written request for information and copies or representative samples of the specific information that was requested to this office after the expiration of the fifteen business day period mandated by section 552.301(e) of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.--Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). The district argues that the submitted information is excepted under section 552.101 of the Government Code. Section 552.101 of the Government Code provides a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977) (presumption of openness overcome by a showing that the information is made confidential by another source of law or affects third party interests). Because the assertion of section 552.101 of the Government Code provides a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address your arguments.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 21.355 of the Education Code provides, "A document evaluating the performance of a teacher or administrator is confidential." This office has interpreted this section to apply to any document that evaluates, as that term is commonly understood, the performance of a teacher or administrator. Open Records Decision No. 643 (1996). In that opinion, this office also concluded that a teacher is someone who is required to hold and does hold a certificate or permit required under chapter 21 of the Education Code and is teaching at the time of his or her evaluation. *Id.* Similarly, an administrator is someone who is required to hold and does hold a certificate required under chapter 21 of the Education Code and is administering at the time of his or her evaluation. *Id.*

In this case, the district failed to indicate that the individual who is the subject of the evaluations held the appropriate teacher's or administrator's certificate or permit at the time of each evaluation. Based on the reasoning set out in Open Records Decision No. 643, we conclude that if the individual was a teacher or administrator holding the appropriate certificate or permit at the time of the evaluations, the documents at issue are confidential under section 21.355 of the Education Code, and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code. In the event that the individual did not hold the appropriate certificate or permit at the time of his evaluations, section 21.355 of the Education Code is inapplicable, and the submitted information may not be withheld under section 552.101.

Finally, we note that section 552.117 of the Government Code may also be applicable to some of the submitted information. Section 552.117(1) excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024. Whether a particular piece of

information is protected by section 552.117 must be determined at the time the request is received by the governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Therefore, the district may only withhold information under section 552.117(1) on behalf of current or former officials or employees who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for this information was received by the district. For those employees who timely elected to keep their personal information confidential, the district must withhold the employees' home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and any information that reveals whether these employees have family members. The district may not withhold this information under section 552.117(1) for those employees who did not make a timely election to keep the information confidential.

Accordingly, if the individual who is the subject of the evaluations was a teacher or administrator holding the appropriate certificate or permit at the time of the evaluations, the documents at issue are confidential under section 21.355 of the Education Code, and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code. In the event that the individual did not hold the appropriate certificate or permit at the time of his evaluations, section 21.355 of the Education Code is inapplicable, and the submitted information may not be withheld under section 552.101. The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor, except for information that we have marked which may be excepted from disclosure under section 552.117.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one

of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877)673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.--Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512)475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/jh

Ref: ID# 179463

Enc.   Submitted documents

c: Mr. Bob Measles
        254 CR 2303
        Mineola, Texas 75773
        (w/o enclosures)